

1 LAURENCE PARADIS (California Bar No. 122336)
2 STUART SEABORN (California Bar No. 198590)
3 MICHAEL S. NUNEZ (California Bar No. 280535)
4 DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES
5 2001 Center Street, Third Floor
6 Berkeley, CA 94704
7 Telephone: (510) 665-8644
8 Facsimile: (510) 665-8511
9 TTY: (510) 665-8716

6 JAY KOSLOFSKY (California Bar No. 97024)
7 LAW OFFICES OF JAY KOSLOFSKY
8 P.O. Box 9236
9 Berkeley, CA 94709
10 Telephone: (510) 280-5627
11 Fax: (510) 845-3707

12 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
12 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
13 OAKLAND DIVISION
14

15 LIGHTHOUSE FOR THE BLIND AND
16 VISUALLY IMPAIRED, on behalf of
17 itself and all others similarly situated,
18 ANGELA GRIFFITH, on behalf of herself
19 and all others similarly situated,
20 LISAMARIA MARTINEZ, on behalf of
21 herself and all others similarly situated,
22 JOSH SAUNDERS, on behalf of himself
23 and all others similarly situated, SHANA
24 RAY, on behalf of herself and all others
25 similarly situated, and JENNIFER
26 WESTBROOK, on behalf of herself and all
27 others similarly situated,

28 Plaintiffs,

v.

REDBOX AUTOMATED RETAIL, LLC,
AND SAVE MART SUPERMARKETS,

Defendants.

No. 12-cv-00195 PJH

**(PROPOSED) FINDINGS OF FACT AND
CONCLUSIONS OF LAW REGARDING
PLAINTIFFS' APPLICATION FOR
REASONABLE ATTORNEYS' FEES AND
COSTS**

[PROPOSED] FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Plaintiffs have applied to the Court for an order approving attorneys' fees and reimbursement of litigation costs to Class Counsel in the amount of \$800,000, which includes: attorneys' fees in the amount of \$690,000 for Class Counsel's work on the case from its inception through final approval of the Settlement Agreement ("Agreement"); \$75,000 in attorneys' fees and costs for monitoring and enforcing the terms the Agreement, and \$35,000 in litigation costs. Defendants Redbox Automated Retail, LLC ("Redbox") and Save Mart Supermarkets ("Save Mart") do not oppose the motion, and these are the amounts contained in the Agreement between Plaintiffs and Defendants. Having read the papers submitted and carefully considered the arguments and relevant legal authority, and good cause appearing, the Court GRANTS Plaintiffs' Motion for Reasonable Attorneys' Fees and Costs and finds and rules as follows:

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. The Court finds that Plaintiffs have submitted sufficient evidence supporting their claim for reasonable attorneys' fees and costs, and hereby approves the settlement of attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of \$800,000 for work performed on this matter, as stated in Section 14 of the Agreement, which includes: attorneys' fees in the amount of \$690,000 for Class Counsel's work on the case through final approval of the agreement, \$75,000 for monitoring and enforcing the terms of the Agreement after Final Approval, and \$35,000 in litigation costs.

2. The Court finds that Plaintiffs have provided sufficient evidence, including declarations from practitioners in the field, supporting the reasonableness of their 2014 requested hourly rates. The Court finds that the requested hourly rates correspond to the prevailing market rate in the relevant community, considering the experience, skill, and reputation of the attorneys in question.

3. The Court hereby approves the following 2014 hourly rates as reasonable.

Name	Year of Graduation	Rate
Laurence Paradis	1985	\$845
Shawna Parks	1999	\$690

4. The Court further finds that Counsel has submitted sufficient evidence of the time and effort undertaken by Class Counsel in prosecuting and settling the claims, and that this time and effort was reasonable and necessary in light of the needs of the litigation. The Court also finds that Class Counsel staffed the litigation appropriately and efficiently given the needs of the litigation.

IT IS SO ORDERED:

PHYLLIS J. HAMILTON
Judge of the United States District Court
Northern District of California